

# Magnitude and Factors Affecting Virological Treatment Failure among HIV Reactive Adults from Selected Hospitals of North Shoa Zone, Amhara Region, Ethiopia.

Behailu Tariku Derseh (✉ [minastariku@gmail.com](mailto:minastariku@gmail.com))

Debre Berhan University

Belay Shewayerga

Debre Berhan University

Abinet Dagnaw

Debre Berhan University

Elyas Admasu Basha

Debre Berhan University

---

## Research Article

**Keywords:** Adherence, First-line ART, virologic treatment failure, North Shoa, Ethiopia

**Posted Date:** August 20th, 2020

**DOI:** <https://doi.org/10.21203/rs.3.rs-61560/v1>

**License:** © ⓘ This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 International License.

[Read Full License](#)

---

1 **Magnitude and Factors Affecting Virological Treatment Failure among HIV Reactive**  
2 **Adults from Selected Hospitals of North Shoa Zone, Amhara Region, Ethiopia.**

3 Behailu Tariku Derseh<sup>1\*</sup>, Belay Shewayerga<sup>1</sup>, Abinet Dagnaw<sup>1</sup>, Elyas Admasu Basha<sup>2</sup>

4 <sup>1</sup> Department of Public Health, College of Health Sciences, Debre Berhan University, Ethiopia.

5 <sup>2</sup> Department of Nursing, College of Health Sciences, Debre Berhan University, Ethiopia.

6 Corresponding author: Behailu Tariku Derseh ([minastariku@gmail.com](mailto:minastariku@gmail.com))

7 Email address

8 Belay Shewayerga ([belaysheawayrga@gmail.com](mailto:belaysheawayrga@gmail.com))

9 Abinet Dagnaw ([abinetdagn@gmail.com](mailto:abinetdagn@gmail.com))

10 Elyas Admasu Basha ([admasu.elias5@gmail.com](mailto:admasu.elias5@gmail.com))

11 **Abstract**

12 **Background:** Nowadays Human Immuno-deficiency Virus (HIV) is one of the devastating and  
13 prevalent virus affecting the globe without a cure. Highly Active Antiretroviral Therapy (HAART)  
14 significantly reduced the morbidity and mortality of patients with HIV infection. Although there  
15 is increasing global use of antiretroviral therapy (ART) for the treatment of HIV/AIDs, the global  
16 trends in ART failure is growing. In developing countries including Ethiopia, particularly in our  
17 study settings, information related to magnitude and correlates of virological treatment failure is  
18 scarce. Thus, this study aimed at assessing the magnitude of virological treatment failure and  
19 associated factors among HIV reactive adults at selected hospitals of north Shoa, Amhara Region,  
20 Ethiopia.

21 **Methods:** a facility based cross-sectional study was conducted among 498 study participants who  
22 started their first-line HAART from August 2005 to December 2018. Data were collected from  
23 patients' charts and face-to-face interviews using a structured questionnaire. Bivariable analysis  
24 was executed to select candidate predictor variables at a p-value less than 0.2. Multivariable

25 logistic regression (forward stepwise, conditional) analysis was used to identify factors associated  
26 with virologic failure at significant level of 5%. Model adequacy check was done by Hosmer and  
27 Lemshow ( $p = 0.57$ ) and Naglkerke R Square (0.46) was calculated to express the variability of  
28 virological failure by predictors.

29 **Result:** More than half 290 (58.2%) of study participants were females. The median age at ART  
30 initiation was 40 years with an interquartile range (IQR) of 15 years. The median duration of  
31 virologic failure since initiation of treatment was 96 months (IQR) of 72. The magnitude of  
32 virological treatment failure was 10.24% (95% CI: 7.57% - 12.91%). Poor ART drug adherence  
33 (AOR = 4.54; 95% CI: 2.09, 9.87), CD4 count less than 250 cell/ $\mu$ l (AOR = 24.88; 95% CI: 11.73,  
34 52.81) and Poor Quality of Life (QoL) (AOR = 2.65; 95% CI: 1.12, 6.25) were independent  
35 predictors of virologic failure.

36 **Conclusion:** The magnitude of Virologic ART treatment failure in this study was relatively high.  
37 Poor ART drug adherence, patients' having lower CD4 count and poorer quality of life were  
38 predictors of treatment failure. Thus, intervention program that enrich patients' health related  
39 quality of life should be implemented. Moreover, counselling that supplement the importance of  
40 drug adherence and reduction of risks that lowers CD4 counts should be given emphasis which in  
41 turn helps to prevent first-line ART treatment failure.

42 **Keywords:** Adherence, First-line ART, virologic treatment failure, North Shoa, Ethiopia

## 43 **Background**

44 HIV continues to be a major global public health problem. In 2016, an estimated 36.7 million  
45 people living with HIV, among this 34.5 million were adults and 2.1 million were children, with a  
46 global HIV prevalence of 0.8% among adults. There were approximately 1.8 million new HIV  
47 infections - a decline from 2.1 million new infections in 2015. The vast majority of people living  
48 with HIV are located in low- and middle- income countries, with an estimated 25.5 million living  
49 in sub-Saharan Africa. Among this group, 19.4 million are living in East and Southern Africa this  
50 year(1, 2). In 2016 around 1 million people were died with AIDS-related illnesses compared to  
51 1.9 million in 2005 and 1.5 million in 2010 (1, 3).

52 Globally, 20.9 million [18.4 million–21.7 million] people living with HIV were accessing  
53 antiretroviral therapy in June 2017. In 2016, around 53% [39–65%] of all people living with HIV  
54 had access to treatment. Some 54% [40–65%] of adults aged 15 years and older living with HIV  
55 had access to treatment. In eastern and southern Africa, 11.7 million people were accessing  
56 antiretroviral therapy, 60% [48–68%] of all people living with HIV in the region in 2016. In  
57 Ethiopia, 420 000, 59% [47%–73%] people were accessing antiretroviral therapy in 2016, among  
58 this 399000, 61% [49%–75%] adults aged 15 years and older living with HIV had access to  
59 treatment (1, 4).

60 WHO recommendation to “treat all” principles to reach a total of 36.7 million people who must be  
61 successfully maintained on treatment for life. The global expansion of antiretroviral therapy has  
62 been the primary contributor to a 48% decline in deaths from AIDS-related causes, from a peak of  
63 1.9 million [1.7 million–2.2 million] in 2005 to 1.0 million [830 000 – 1 2 million] in 2016 (5, 6).  
64 With this scale-up of ART coverage, an increasing proportion of people initiating ART are likely

65 to be infected with a virus that is resistant to one or more WHO-recommended first-line ARV  
66 drugs (7).

67 According to WHO definition, ART failure is defined as clinically (New or recurrent clinical  
68 event), immunologically (CD4 count falls to the baseline) and virological failure (viral load above  
69 1000 copies/ml based on two consecutive viral load measurements after 3 months with adherence  
70 support), after 6 months of Effective treatment (8). WHO's Report on HIV drug resistance  
71 (HIVDR) 2017 demonstrates a steady increase in the prevalence of HIVDR in individuals initiating  
72 first-line ART since 2001, most notably in Southern and Eastern Africa. The prevalence of HIVDR  
73 in people initiating first-line ART was 6.8% in 2010, and estimates from recent nationally  
74 representative surveys indicate levels of HIVDR above 10% (5). Currently, WHO recommended  
75 first-line ART includes Tenofovir (TDF), Efavirenz (EFV) combined with Lamivudine(3TC),  
76 and Zidovudine (AZT) alternatives for TDF and Nevirapine (NVP), Dolutegravir ( DTG )as  
77 alternatives for EFV (8).

78 The treatment of millions of people with this first-line antiretroviral (ARV) drugs will inevitably  
79 be accompanied by the emergence and transmission of drug-resistant virus. HIVDR limits  
80 treatment options and may necessitate a switch to more expensive regimens (2<sup>nd</sup> line ART) which  
81 associated with greater long-term toxicity. Moreover, significant population-levels of treatment  
82 failure may lead to an increase in HIV/AIDS-related morbidity and mortality (8, 9).

83 In Ethiopia, 718,500 people were living with HIV/AIDS in 2016, Of these, 653,412 were adults  
84 and 65,088 were children under 15 years of age, adult HIV prevalence was 1.18 at this year(3).  
85 Antiretroviral Therapy (ART) service began in August 2003 with payment and free ART was

86 launched in January 2005. Ethiopia has already adopted major strategies of WHO guidance to meet  
87 the third **90** targets (90% of people on treatment are virally suppressed). In 2016 a total of 420,000  
88 people living with HIV were put on anti-retroviral treatment and virological suppression rates were  
89 51% at the national level(4, 10). Currently, patients on HAART are monitored with viral load,  
90 immunological and clinical assessment among this viral load monitoring is the gold standard  
91 method to diagnose ART failure. Though WHO’s recommendation to “treat all” living with HIV  
92 immediately after confirming HIV diagnosis that helps to reduce morbidity levels and premature  
93 death and the continued expansion of ART coverage, there were an increasing proportion of people  
94 on ART had HIV drug resistance (HIVDR); like Pretreatment HIV drug resistance (PDR) and  
95 acquired HIV drug resistance (ADR) to one or more of first-line ARV drugs (10, 11).

96 The human cost of HIVDR cannot be underestimated. HIV drug resistance is associated with  
97 increased mortality and reduced effectiveness of treatment regimens. So preventing, monitoring  
98 and responding to HIVDR is therefore critical to maintaining current achievements, improving  
99 patient outcomes, and guaranteeing the long term sustainability of care and treatment programs  
100 (7). Studies have been conducted from different countries to identify the magnitude and factors  
101 associated with first-line ART failure like in low-income and middle-income countries, systematic  
102 review and meta-regression analysis, which indicate that the prevalence estimate of first-line ART  
103 resistance in 2016 were 11% in southern Africa, 10.1% in eastern Africa, 7.2% in western and  
104 central Africa, and 9.4% in Latin America and the Caribbean (12).

105 According to a study conducted in Tanzania, more than 50% of the patients on first-line ART  
106 were experiencing immunological failure. Another study conducted in the Tigray region in 2017  
107 virological and immunological failure in the study area were 11.5% and 6.5%, respectively(13,

108 14), 29% in Colombia (15), 74% in Sweden (Hunduran) (16), 28% in China (17). However, in  
109 our study settings, studies which assess the association between virologic failure and health related  
110 quality of life among ARV clients were scarce. Therefore, this study was aimed to assess the  
111 magnitude and predictors of virologic treatment failure among adult people with first-line ART.

## 112 **Methods**

### 113 **Study Area and Setting**

114 Currently, there are eight public hospitals, one private hospital, and more than ten Health center  
115 that providing ART services in North Shoa zone. Among these eight public hospitals, four district  
116 hospitals started ART services recently. The study was conducted in high caseload health  
117 institutions; Debre Berhan referral hospital and Mehal Meda District hospital, both located in north  
118 Shoa zone, Amhara region, Ethiopia. According to the monthly report of Debre Berhan hospital,  
119 as of December 2018, in Debre Berhan referral hospital ever enrolled HIV positive clients to  
120 chronic HIV care starting from September 2005-December 2018 is 5951, patients ever started on  
121 Highly Active Antiretroviral Therapy (HAART) is 3834 and total current on ART is 1712 among  
122 this who's age  $\geq 18$  years is 1651(F=1067, M=584)(18). In Mehal Meda Hospital the number of  
123 patients ever enrolled in HIV chronic care starting from September 2005- December 2018, is 1005,  
124 patients ever started on Highly Active Antiretroviral Therapy (HAART) is 767 and total current  
125 on ART is 448 among this who's age  $\geq 18$  years is 411 (F=246, M=165)(19).

126 **Study Design and Period**

127 A facility based cross-sectional study design was conducted among HIV-positive patients on  
128 HAART for  $\geq 6$  months to evaluate the magnitude of first-line ART failure and its associated  
129 factors from January 28/2019 - March 22/2019.

130 **Source and study population**

131 The source population were all human immunodeficiency virus (HIV) infected clients with age  
132  $\geq 18$  yrs who were on first-line Antiretroviral Therapy (ART) regimen in Debre Berhan referral  
133 Hospital and Mehal-Meda district Hospital. The study population were all HIV/AIDS clients who  
134 are enrolled in the HAART program, who meet the inclusion criteria and available during the study  
135 period to get service from the ART unit.

136 **Sample size determination and sampling procedure**

137 The sample size is determined based on a single population proportion formula. The proportion of  
138 first-line Anti-retroviral Treatment Failure is taken from a study done in Ethiopia (14). Where,  $p$   
139  $= 0.115$ , confidence interval of 95% ( $Z \frac{\alpha}{2}$ , critical value 1.96), with a marginal error of 4% and  
140 10% non-response rate. The sample size ( $n$ ) is calculated as;  $n = \left( Z \frac{\alpha}{2} \right)^2 * \frac{p(1-p)}{d^2} = (1.96)^2$   
141  $* \frac{0.115(1-0.115)}{(0.04 \times 0.04)^2} = 244$  by considering 10% non-response rate, and multiplying it by a design effect  
142 of 2, the total sample size estimated was 538.

143 A cluster sampling technique was used to select hospitals. There are eight public hospitals in North  
144 Shoa Zone. Out of eight ART-site public hospitals, four hospitals were selected by the number of  
145 cases they have and late initiation of ART. Then, Debre Berhan referral hospital and Mehal-Meda  
146 district hospital were selected by a simple random sampling technique from four hospitals.



147 Finally, consecutive sampling technique was used to select 538 study participants from two HIV  
148 care center clinics, by allocating total sample size proportionally based on the number of clients/  
149 patients they have.

### 150 **Operational definition**

151 **Adherence:** the extent to which a person's activities, taking medications, following corresponds  
152 with accepting instructions from a health care provider (20).

153 **Good adherence:** if a client used greater than or equal to 95% adherence, that is, missing only 1  
154 out of 30 doses or missing 2 from the 60 doses(8).

155 **Fair adherence:** if a client used 85-94% adherence, meaning, missing 2-4 doses out of 30 doses  
156 or 4 to 9 doses from 60 doses(8).

157 **Poor adherence:** if a client used less than 85% adherence, that is, missing  $\geq 5$  doses out of 30  
158 doses or more than 10 doses from 60 doses (8).

159 **Virological failure:** is considered in this study, if a patient has virological failure. That is viral  
160 load above 1000 copies/mL based on two consecutive viral load measurements in 3 months, with  
161 adherence support following the first viral load test (8).

162 **Immunological failure:** CD4 count at or below 250 cells/mm<sup>3</sup> following clinical failure or  
163 Persistent CD4 levels below 100 cells/mm<sup>3</sup>(8).

164 **Clinical failure:** New or recurrent clinical event indicating severe immunodeficiency after 6  
165 months of effective treatment(8).

### 166 **Data collection tool and procedure**

167 Data collection was conducted by using a structured questionnaire and structured checklist to  
168 collect data from patient follow up form, ART register and the electronic database for ART  
169 program. Relevant clinical data such as CD4 count, clinical stage, HAART regimen, and drug

170 adherence status were extracted from participants' medical charts. Data on supply disruptions of  
171 HIV-commodities like ART regimens was interviewed by the clients and from existing registers.  
172 In addition, all selected sampled clients who come to ART follow up clinics were interviewed to  
173 collect socio-demographic information and drug adherence level. The questionnaire was prepared  
174 in the English language and translated into Amharic and back to English to confirm the consistency  
175 questionnaire and checklist. Data were collected by two health information technology (HIT)  
176 personnel's that have diploma and experience in managing ART data. Two data collectors and  
177 two supervisors (BSC nurses) were trained for half a day about the objectives of the study, the  
178 contents of tools and how to collect the data before the data collection. Health related Quality of  
179 Life (HRQoL) of the clients was measured to quantify multidimensional components of health  
180 perceived by clients in the past two weeks prior to data collection and includes; physical, mental,  
181 emotional, and social domains (21). The tool is known as WHOQOL-HIV BREF and developed  
182 by World Health Organization; Mental Health Department. The questions are measured in 5-scales  
183 and we tested the reliability in our context (Cronbach  $\alpha = 0.727$ ).

#### 184 **Data Processing and Analysis.**

185 The data were checked for completeness and consistency during data collection. The data also  
186 cleaned during data entry into EPI info version 3.5.1 and has been transported into SPSS version  
187 20. Data exploration technique was used to check the inconsistency and detect outliers in the  
188 dataset. Normality test was performed by using Shapiro-Wilk (P-Value  $> 0.05$ ), Kolmogorov-  
189 Smirnova (P-Value  $> 0.05$ ), and visual inspection of Q-Q Plot, P-P Plot, and Histogram.  
190 Descriptive statistics was used to express variables in terms of tables, percentages and frequencies.  
191 Bivariable binary logistic regression was used to select predictor variables at a cut off points ( $<$   
192 0.2). Logistic regression assumptions (sample size and multicollinearity test) were used to check

193 whether variables have satisfied the rules in regression or not. Variance Inflation Factor (VIF) >  
 194 10 was used to declare the presence and absence of multicollinearity. Forward stepwise conditional  
 195 logistic regression analysis was used to determine the independent predictors of virologic failure.  
 196 To calculate the measures of association, Adjusted Odds Ratio (AOR) with its 95% Confidence  
 197 Interval (CI) at 5% level of significance was used. Model fitness test was performed by Hosmer  
 198 and Lemshow test (p=0.573) and model summary was done by Naglkerke R square (0.461) which  
 199 express the variability of virologic treatment failure in terms of CD4 counts, Quality of Life and  
 200 ART treatment drug adherence.

## 201 **Result**

### 202 **Socio-demographic characteristics of patients**

203 A total of 498 HIV infected individuals on first-line ART regimens were voluntarily participated  
 204 in this study with a response rate of 92.5%. The rest clients were refused to participate in the study  
 205 due to unwillingness. More than half 290 (58.2%) of the study participants were female. The  
 206 median age of the participants was 40 with an interquartile range of (IQR = 15). Regarding the  
 207 educational level, 80 (16.1%) of the study participants had no formal education, 209 (42%) of them  
 208 completed primary school, 86 (17.3%) completed college or university. Seventy-six (15.3%) were  
 209 government employees and 230 (46.2%) of them were self-employed. Two-hundred sixty-one  
 210 (52.4%) of the study participants had a monthly income above 1000 per month (Table 1).

211 Table 1. Socio-demographic characteristics of the respondents in Debre-Berhan referral hospital  
 212 and Mehal-Meda hospital, North Showa Zone, April/2019. (n=498)

Variable	Frequency	Percent
<b>Sex</b>		
Female	290	58.2

213	Male	208	41.8	
	<b>Age(year)</b>			
214	18-30	68	13.7	
	31-45	264	53.0	
	46-60	142	28.5	
	>60	24	4.8	215
	<b>Religion</b>			
216	Orthodox	465	93.4	
	Muslim	19	3.8	
217	Protestant	14	2.8	
	<b>Employment</b>			
218	Employed full time	76	15.3	
	Unemployed	103	20.7	
	Self-employed	230	46.2	
219	Farmer	89	17.9	
	<b>Level of education</b>			
220	Not educated	80	16.1	
	Elementary	209	42.0	
221	Secondary	123	24.7	
	College and above	86	17.3	
	<b>Residence</b>			
222	Urban	418	83.9	
	Rural	80	16.1	
	<b>Monthly income</b>			223
	<=500	82	16.5	224
	501-100	155	31.1	
	>1000	261	52.4	225

**Baseline clinical characteristics of patients**

226 The majority, 434 (87.1%) of study participants were working by their functional status and 482  
227 (96.8%) of participants had hemoglobin measurement of greater or equal to 10 mg/dl at the start  
228 of HAART. The median CD4 count was 184 cell/ $\mu$ l (IQR=182) and TB infection was confirmed  
229 in 138 (27.7%) since the start of HAART. Moreover, 190 (38.2%) and 91 (18.3%) of study  
230 participants had started treatment with Tenofovir- Lamivudine-Efavirenz, and Zidovudine-  
231 Lamivudine-Efavirenz regimen, respectively. In addition, one hundred sixteen (23.3%) of them

232 have a history of malnutrition and 125 (25.1%) of the participants were non-adhered to their  
 233 medication (Table 2).

234

235 **Table 2.** Baseline and follow up characteristics of HIV/AIDS clients on antiretroviral therapy in  
 236 Debre-Berhan referral hospital and Mehal-Meda hospital, North Shoa Zone, April/2019 (n=498).

Variable	Category	Frequency (%)
<b>Baseline first-line HAART regimen</b>	D4T+3TC+NVP	67(13.5)
	D4T+3TC+EFV	32(6.4)
	AZT+3TC+NVP	82(16.5)
	AZT+3TC+EFV	91(18.3)
	TDF+3TC+EFV	190(38.2)
	TDF+3TPC+NV	36(7.2)
<b>Baseline WHO stages</b>	I	398(79.9)
	II	70(14.1)
	III	30(6.0)
<b>Baseline hemoglobin level</b>	<10	16(3.2)
	≥10	482(96.8)
<b>History of TB</b>	Yes	138(27.7)
	No	360(72.3)
<b>Functional status</b>	Working	434(87.1)
	Ambulatory	60(12.0)
	Bed-ridden	4(0.8)
<b>Baseline CD4 results</b>	≤100	107(21.5)
	101-350	306(61.4)
	351-500	45 (9)
	≥501	40 (8)
<b>Time on ART (months)</b>	6-48	95 (19.1)
	49-72	105 (21.1)
	73-156	298 (59.8)
<b>ART drug Adherence</b>	Good	373 (74.9)
	Fair and Poor	125 (25.1)
<b>BMI</b>	Undernourished	116 (23.3)
	Well-nourished	382 (76.7)

237 **The magnitude of first-line ART virologic failure**

238 The magnitude of virologic failure ( $\geq 1000$  RNA copies per ml) was found in 51 (10.24%; 95%  
 239 CI: 7.57%, 12.91%). Since the start of HAART, 43 (8.63%) of them encountered virologic failure  
 240 within 73-156 months (Table3).

241

242 **Table 3:** Treatment failure after initiation of HAART in HIV/AIDS clients in Debre-Berhan  
 243 referral hospital and Mehal-Meda hospital, North Shoa Zone, April/2019 (n=498).

Variable	Categories	Frequency (%)
Immunologic failure	Yes	47 (9.4)
	No	451 (90.6)
Virologic failure	Yes	51 (10.2)
	No	447 (89.8)
Months from ART initiation	6-48	3 (5.88)
	49-72	5 (9.8)
	73-156	43 (84.4)

244 **Factors associated with virologic treatment failure**

245 After conducting bivariable analysis on predictor variables with a p-value  $\leq 0.2$ , then multivariable  
 246 logistic regression analysis has been conducted to control the effects of socio-demographic,  
 247 behavioral, and clinical factors. Then, poor ART drug adherence (AOR = 4.54; 95% CI: 2.09,  
 248 9.87), people who had CD4 counts less than 250 cell/ $\mu$ l (AOR = 24.88; 95% CI: 11.73, 52.81) and  
 249 PLWHA who had poor quality of life (QoL) (AOR = 2.65; 95% CI: 1.12, 6.25) were found  
 250 statistically associated with first-line ART virologic treatment failure (**Table 4**).

251

252

253

254  
255  
256  
257  
258

**Table 4:** Bivariable and Multivariable Logistic Regression analysis of selected factors of virologic failure in Debre Berhan and Mehal-Meda hospitals, North Shoa Zone, 2019 (n=498).

Variables	Virologic treatment failure		COR, 95% CI	p-value	AOR, 95% CI
	No	Yes			
<b>Age(years)</b>					
<30 years	57	11	1.88 (0.913,3.877)	0.087	-
≥ 30 years	390	40	1		
<b>Monthly Income</b>					
<1500 ETB	262	35	1.545 (0.830,2.873)	0.170	-
≥ 1500 ETB	185	16	1		
<b>Living area</b>					
Urban	379	39	1		
Rural	68	12	1.715(0.855, 3.442)	0.129	-
<b>ART adherence</b>					
Good	385	25	1		1
Poor	62	26	6.458 (3.505,11.89)	<0.001	<b>4.54 (2.09, 9.87)</b>
<b>Current BMI</b>					
<18.5	96	15	1		
≥18.5	351	36	1.523(0.801, 2.899)	0.152	-
<b>WHO stage of HIV/AIDS</b>					
Stage I	442	42	18.94 (6.07, 59.11)	<0.001	-
Stage II & III	5	9	1		
<b>Current CD4 count</b>					
<250 cell/μl	25	34	33.76 (16.62, 68.88)	<0.001	<b>24.88 (11.73, 52.81)</b>
≥ 250 cell/μl	422	17	1		1
<b>Quality of life</b>					
Poor	237	42	4.15 (1.97, 8.73)	<0.001	<b>2.65 (1.12, 6.25)</b>
Good	210	09	1		1

259 **Discussion**

260 The identification and management of virologic ART treatment failure is a key challenge for HIV  
 261 programs in resource-limited settings. ART treatment failure is a serious emerging threat to the  
 262 global scale-up of HIV treatment access and staying with this failing first-line therapy is associated  
 263 with an increased risk of morbidity and mortality (22). This study particularly was designed to

264 determine the magnitude of virologic treatment failure (10.24%) and identify the predictors of  
265 virologic failure (Poor ART drug adherence, CD4 count less than 250cell/ $\mu$ l and clients' whose  
266 poor quality of life).

267 The magnitude of virologic treatment failure was 10.24% (51/498). This finding was consistent  
268 with the study conducted in guinea 13.7% (**23**) and Bahir Dar 10.7% (**24**). However, when  
269 compared with other studies, for instance, a study conducted in coastal Kenya (24,6%)(**25**), Debre  
270 Markos hospital (21%) (**26**), Colombia (29%) (**15**), Sweden, Honduran (74%) (**16**), and China  
271 (28%) (**17**), it was low. This discrepancy may be due to most clients on first-line ART treatment  
272 failure shift to second-line ART. This 10.2% virological treatment failure indicated that first-line  
273 ART treatment may not be effective, as WHO recommends changing their first-line ART regimen  
274 if levels of Non-nucleoside reverse-transcriptase inhibitor (NNRTI) pretreatment HIV drug  
275 resistance (PDR) reach 10% (**27**), So further investigation is needed on pretreatment HIVDR to  
276 NNRTIs.

277 The current study showed that ART treatment adherence was the independent predicting factor for  
278 the virologic treatment failure and patients with poor ART drug adherence were 4.5 times at higher  
279 risk of developing treatment failure compared to patients with good ART drug adherence. This  
280 finding is consistent with a systematic review conducted in Ethiopia (**28**). Medication adherence  
281 has opportunity for best viral suppression, immune recovery, and as a result clinical benefit will  
282 be gained. Thus, successful ART treatment requires all medications should be taken as per  
283 prescribed by the physicians (health care service giver). However, this result contradicts from  
284 studies done in the Tigray region of northern Ethiopia, Gondar and Felege-Hiwot Referral  
285 Hospitals (14, **29**, **24**). These variations may be related to the type of data collection method. In



286 our study, the data on adherence were collected from one-month recall self-reported missed doses,  
287 rather than directly collecting from the patients' charts.

288 Another predictor variable which has significant association with virologic failure was CD4 count.  
289 Individuals who have CD4 count less than 250 cell/ $\mu$ l were 24 times more likely to develop  
290 virologic failure than their counter parts (AOR = 24.88; 95% CI: 11.449, 52.81). This result was  
291 in line with studies conducted in different parts of the world; University of Gondar Hospital (AOR  
292 = 9.03; 95% CI: 4.40, 18.50) (30), Zewditu Memorial Hospital (AOR = 2.67; 95% CI: 1.29, 5.51)  
293 (31), a multi-center study conducted at three selected Hospitals northwest Ethiopia (AHR = 2.0;  
294 95% CI: 1.20, 3.50) (32), and Felege-Hiwot Hospital (AOR = 8.63; 95% CI: 3.32, 22.42) (24).  
295 Since ART treatment provides opportunities for viral load suppression, recovery of immunity and  
296 finally a client get clinical benefits. Thus, all individuals taking ART drugs are expected to take  
297 all medications as prescribed. As a consequent, the number of CD4 counts increases and helps in  
298 the successfulness of immunological treatment.

299 Health Related Quality of Life (HRQoL) was another independent predictor variable for virologic  
300 treatment failure. Clients with poor Quality of Life were 2.6 times more likely to develop virologic  
301 failure than clients with good (QoL) (AOR = 2.65; 95% CI: 1.12, 6.25). Maintaining and  
302 improving the quality of life among people in ART follow up clinics is regarded as the most  
303 important components of HIV/AIDS care and treatment even though this concept is not given  
304 emphasis in developing countries where resources are scarce. Similar finding was observed in  
305 study done in Ethiopia where immunologic treatment failure was associated with health related  
306 quality of life among people infected with HIV/AIDS (33). Since measuring the quality of life of  
307 people with HIV/AIDS consisted of several dimensions (physical, psychological, independence,  
308 social, environmental, and spiritual), stakeholders should work on the betterment of quality of life

309 among people on HAART. As the result indicated 56.02% (51.65%, 60.40%) of the clients' quality  
310 of life was compromised by the disease (HIV/AIDS) and related complications. Thus, this  
311 significant number of clients needs their health related quality of life to be changed.

### 312 **Strength and limitations of the study**

313 Since the study was conducted in health facilities taking a representative sample, the results can  
314 be generalized to health facilities in North Shoa Zone of Amhara Region, Ethiopia. But, the results  
315 can be interpreted with limitations. First due to the cross-sectional nature of the study design, we  
316 could not establish the temporal relationship between virological failure and its predictors. Recall  
317 and social desirability bias where the participants may not respond correctly for some sensitive  
318 questions due to memory loss and social norms. To reduce such systematic errors, during data  
319 collection period data collectors tried to explain the importance of honest response. Moreover,  
320 smaller sample size in certain categories of predictor variable may reduce the precision of the  
321 measure of association. Thus, the use of this study finding for any concern should be accounted in  
322 consideration having these inherent limitations of the study.

### 323 **Conclusion**

324 The magnitude of virologic failure in this study was relatively high. Poor ART drug adherence,  
325 CD4 counts less than 250  $\mu\text{l/ml}$  and poor health related quality of life were found to be significant  
326 predictors of virologic treatment failure. Thus, Early ART failure detection is one of the most  
327 important key improvement areas of the health care providers with close follow up of the patients.  
328 Moreover, intervention that enhance the quality of life of clients on ART should be established.  
329 Behavior change communication on the benefits of good ART drug adherence should be  
330 strengthened which in turn expected to reduces the risks of the decrement of CD4 counts.

331 **List of Acronyms and abbreviation**

332 ADR: Acquired HIV drug resistance; ART: Antiretroviral Therapy; ARV: Anti-retroviral  
333 HAART: Highly Active Antiretroviral Therapy; HIV/AIDS: Human Immune Deficiency  
334 Virus/Acquired Immune Deficiency Syndrome; HIVDR: HIV drug resistance; PDR: Pretreatment  
335 HIV drug resistance; PLHIV: People Living with HIV; TDR: Transmitted HIV drug resistance

336 **Declarations**

337 **Acknowledgement**

338 We would like to express our heartfelt gratitude to Debre Berhan University, College of Health  
339 Sciences, and Department of Public Health for monitoring and evaluation of this project. This  
340 work is impossible without the support of staff working at Debre Berhan Comprehensive  
341 Specialized Hospital and Mehal Meda Hospital - thanks for your support during data collection  
342 time. Moreover, study participants and data collectors deserve appreciations.

343 **Funding**

344 Not applicable

345 **Competing interest**

346 The authors declare that they have no competing interest.

347 **Availability of data**

348 The data used to support the findings of this study are included in this manuscript.

349 **Consent for publication**

350 All authors agree to publish this article in BMC infectious diseases journal; part of Springer Nature.

351 **Authors' contribution**

352 All stated authors have participated in this research project: BTD and BS conceptualized, designed  
353 the study including data analysis, and manuscript writing; AD and EAB drafted the manuscript

354 and critically reviewed the manuscript. All authors read and approved the final version of the  
355 manuscript.

### 356 **Ethics approval and consent to participate**

357 Ethical clearance was obtained from Debre Berhan University, College of Health Sciences, and  
358 Ethical Review Committee. Official letter was submitted to Debre Berhan Comprehensive  
359 Specialized Hospital and Mehal- Meda Hospital to inform and support data collection process.  
360 Verbal informed consent was gained from the study participants by explaining the potential  
361 benefits of the study. Moreover, participants were told that they can stop interview at any point  
362 during data collection if they are uncomfortable and if they don't want to give answer for a  
363 particular question.

### 364 **References**

- 365 1. UNAIDS W. Fact Sheet: World AIDS Day 2017. Global HIV statistics. 2017.
- 366 2. Global HIV and AIDS statistics 2017-09-01.
- 367 3. EHNRI. HIV Related Estimates and Projections for Ethiopia. Addis Ababa: FMOH. 2012:6-  
368 14.
- 369 4. UNAIDS D. Global Statistics. 2017.
- 370 5. Organization WH. Global Action Plan on HIV drug resistance 2017–2021. 2017.
- 371 6. HIV/AIDS JUNPo. Ending AIDS: Progress towards the 90-90-90 targets. Global AIDS  
372 Update. 2017.
- 373 7. Fund G, Organization WH. HIV drug resistance report 2017. 2017.
- 374 8. World Health Organization. Consolidated guidelines on the use of antiretroviral drugs for  
375 treating and preventing HIV infection: recommendations for a public health approach: World  
376 Health Organization; 2016.
- 377 9. World Health Organization. Global report on early warning indicators of HIV drug resistance:  
378 technical report. 2016.

- 379 10. Fethia K, Seble M. National Guidelines For Comprehensive HIV Prevention, Care And  
380 Treatment, 2017.
- 381 11. World Health Organization. Tackling HIV Drug Resistance:Trends, Guidelines and Global  
382 Action. 2017.
- 383 12. Gupta RK, Gregson J, Parkin N, Haile-Selassie H, Tanuri A, Forero LA, et al. HIV-1 drug  
384 resistance before initiation or re-initiation of first-line antiretroviral therapy in low-income and  
385 middle-income countries: a systematic review and meta-regression analysis. *The Lancet*  
386 *infectious diseases*. 2018;18(3):346-55.
- 387 13. Mpondo BC, Kilonzo SB, Meda JR, Gunda DW. Prevalence and predictors of Immunological  
388 failure among HIV-infected adults on HAART in Northwestern Tanzania: A cross sectional  
389 study. *Tanzania Medical Journal*. 2015;27(1).
- 390 14. Hailu GG, Hagos DG, Hagos AK, Wasihun AG, Dejene TA. Virological and immunological  
391 failure of HAART and associated risk factors among adults and adolescents in the Tigray  
392 region of Northern Ethiopia. *PloS one*. 2018;13(5):e0196259.
- 393 15. De La Hoz JM, Bolaño L, Cárdenas O, González R, Sabbag J, Palacio L, et al. Characterization  
394 of treatment failure in HIV positive patients in the Colombian Caribbean region. *Colombia*  
395 *Médica*. 2014;45(4):162-7.
- 396 16. Murillo W, De Rivera I, Parham L, Jovel E, Palou E, Karlsson A, et al. Prevalence of drug  
397 resistance and importance of viral load measurements in Honduran HIV-infected patients  
398 failing antiretroviral treatment. *HIV medicine*. 2010;11(2):95-103.
- 399 17. Ma Y, Zhao D, Yu L, Bulterys M, Robinson ML, Zhao Y, et al. Predictors of virologic failure  
400 in HIV-1-infected adults receiving first-line antiretroviral therapy in 8 provinces in China.  
401 *Clinical infectious diseases*. 2010;50(2):264-71.
- 402 18. Debre Berhan referral Hospital, Monthly Facility Anti-retroviral Therapy Report. December  
403 2018.
- 404 19. Mehal Meda Hospital, Monthly facility ART Report. December 2018.
- 405 20. World Health Organization. Guidance on operations and service delivery: adherence to ART.  
406 2013.
- 407 21. World Health Organization. Mental Health: Evidence and Research Department of Mental  
408 Health and Substance Dependence. World Health Organization, Geneva, 2002.
- 409 22. Avert. Global information and education on HIV and AIDS. 2017.

- 410 23. Gare J, Kelly-Hanku A, Ryan CE, David M, Kaima P, Imara U, et al. Factors influencing  
411 antiretroviral adherence and virological outcomes in people living with HIV in the highlands  
412 of Papua New Guinea. *PLoS One*. 2015;10(8):e0134918.
- 413 24. Bokretsiion GB, Endalkachew N, Getachew KA. HIV/AIDS treatment failure and its  
414 determinant factors among first line HAART patients at Felege-Hiwot Referral Hospital, Bahir  
415 Dar, Northwest Ethiopia. *Journal of AIDS and Clinical Research*. 2017;8(11).
- 416 25. Hassan AS, Nabwera HM, Mwaringa SM, Obonyo CA, Sanders EJ, de Wit TFR, et al. HIV-1  
417 virologic failure and acquired drug resistance among first-line antiretroviral experienced adults  
418 at a rural HIV clinic in coastal Kenya: a cross-sectional study. *AIDS research and therapy*.  
419 2014;11(1):9.
- 420 26. Yayehyirad AM, Mamo WT, Gizachew AT, Tadesse AA. Rate of immunological failure and  
421 its predictors among patients on highly active antiretroviral therapy at Debremarkos hospital,  
422 Northwest Ethiopia: a retrospective follow up study. *Journal of AIDS and Clinical Research*.  
423 2013;4(5).
- 424 27. World Health Organization. Guidelines on the public health response to pretreatment HIV drug  
425 resistance: July 2017. 2017.
- 426 28. Aklilu Endalamaw, Mengistu Mekonen, Demeke Geremew, Fekadu Ambaw, Hiwot Tesera,  
427 Tesfa Dejenie Habtewold. Evidence that poor HAART adherence has a great impact on  
428 HIV/AIDS treatment failure more than severity of illness and opportunity of infection in  
429 Ethiopia: Systematic review and meta-analysis. *bioRxiv preprint first posted online Oct. 11,*  
430 *2018; doi: <http://dx.doi.org/10.1101/440743>*
- 431 29. Ayalew MB, Kumilachew D, Belay A, Getu S, Teju D, Endale D, et al. First-line antiretroviral  
432 treatment failure and associated factors in HIV patients at the University of Gondar Teaching  
433 Hospital, Gondar, Northwest Ethiopia. *HIV/AIDS (Auckland, NZ)*. 2016;8:141.
- 434 30. Belete Bayu, Amare Tariku, Abera Balcha Bulti, Yohannes Ayanaw Habitu, Terefe Derso,  
435 Destaw Fetene Teshome. Determinants of virological failure among patients on highly active  
436 antiretroviral therapy in University of Gondar Referral Hospital, Northwest Ethiopia: a case-  
437 control study. *HIV/AIDS - Research and Palliative Care*. 2017;9 153–159
- 438 31. Sisay C, Bekele A, Sisay A, Mekonen H, Terfa K. Incidence and Predictors of Anti-Retroviral  
439 Treatment (ART) Failure among Adults Receiving HIV Care at Zewditu Memorial Hospital,  
440 Addis Ababa, Ethiopia. *J AIDS Clin Res*. 2017;8(749):2.

- 441 32. Tsegaye AT, Wubshet M, Awoke T, et al. Predictors of treatment failure on second-line  
442 antiretroviral therapy among adults in northwest Ethiopia: a multicenter retrospective follow-  
443 up study. *BMJ Open* 2016; 6:e012537. doi:10.1136/bmjopen-2016-012537
- 444 33. Kebede Abera, Teferi Gedif, Ephrem Engidawork, Tsige Gebre-Mariam. Quality of life of  
445 people living with HIV/AIDS and on highly active antiretroviral therapy in Ethiopia, *African*  
446 *Journal of AIDS Research*, 2010; 9:1, 31-40. [doi.org/10.2989/16085906.2010.484560](https://doi.org/10.2989/16085906.2010.484560)